



Learning Materials Development and Assessment Rubric of Creative Reading Based on Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS) in Bahasa Indonesia at Junior High School

Teuku Alamsyah*¹ and Muhammad Aulia²

¹Department of Indonesian Education, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education,
Universitas Syiah Kuala, Banda Aceh, 23111, Indonesia

²Department of English Education, Faculty of Teacher Training and Education,
Universitas Syiah Kuala, Banda Aceh, 23111, Indonesia

*Corresponding author: teukualamsyah@usk.ac.id

Abstract

The current study contains some goals: (1) analysing the need of teachers of Bahasa Indonesia at Grade VII Junior High School (SMP/MTS) in relation to the learning materials and rubric of assessment of creative reading based on HOTS; (2) developing the relevant instruments of learning materials and the rubric of assessment; and (3) experimenting (try-out and revision) the constructed assessment accordingly. The study employed a research development model by Borg & Gall in combination with Kemp's model. The sources of data were the teachers of Bahasa Indonesia and students at grade VII from two junior high schools (conventional and Islamic schools) in the city of Banda Aceh. The sources of data were taken through purposive sampling that involved methods of document analysis, interview, and observation. The research underwent three interrelated developmental phases: need analysis, designing, and prototyping via implementation, as well as assessment. Based on the outcome of the analysis of the first phase, some needs were identified from three instruments of learning materials and the rubric of assessment of creative reading. Next, they were synthesized with HOTS in the second phase. Last, the third phase is small-group tryout and revision in conjunction with classroom tryout and recursive revision. The result of the analysis shows that the three instruments along with the rubric of assessment of creative reading were developed with the principles of validity, reliability, and compatibility to the teachers' needs. Therefore, the instruments can be disseminated and replicated in a broader context.

Keywords: Assessment rubric, learning materials, research development.

INTRODUCTION

Teaching materials are one of the most crucial elements that must exist to carry out teaching and learning activities (Harsono, 2007). Teaching materials consist of

knowledge, skills, and attitudes or software containing learning messages that are presented using certain equipment in the learning process (Supardi, 2020) and allow students to interact with words, symbols, and ideas (Bukoye, 2019). It can be printed and non-printed items designed to impact information to students in the educational process (Dahar & Faize, 2011).

Language teaching materials are resources that can be used to facilitate language learning such as textbooks, videos, graded readers, flashcards, games, and websites (Tomlinson, 2012). The role of the classroom and teaching materials is to help students utilize resources efficiently to facilitate self-discovery.

Language teaching materials development, as a practical endeavour, refers to everything that teachers, writers, or students do to provide language input resources and exploit those resources in the process of achieving language learning goals. The teaching materials developed should be student-oriented and serve the needs of students (Banu & Gandhi, 2017). Such teaching materials can be in the form of textbooks, stories, advertisements, poems, and examples of language use. Ideally, the development is related to what they know about how language can be learned effectively (Tomlinson, 2011). Another important point is that teaching materials should maximize learning potential by encouraging intellectual, aesthetic, and emotional engagement, which stimulates both right-brain and left-brain activities (see Umam, 2012).

In the framework of 21st-century education, there are four main skills that students must master, namely critical thinking and problem-solving, creativity and innovation, collaboration, and communication (NEA, 2010; Bialik et al., 2015). Language learning that meets the demands of the 4C elements can take the form of creative reading, which is a reading process that involves organizing information in new ways or creating a product. Creative reading is based on access to new images, fiction, and diagrams in the reader's mind by going beyond the information contained in the text being read (Yurdakal, 2019). At this level, students use the cognitive processes of understanding, analyzing, and assessing to create new products that correspond to the content of the text (Maxwell, & Tassell, 2017).

Creative reading in this study is a reading process that refers to higher-order thinking skills in Bloom's revised taxonomy, namely the level of creating (Alamsyah, 2021; Anderson & Krathwohl, 2017; Yurdakal, 2018). Studies by several reviewers found that there is a positive correlation between reading and creativity. Roderick's (1968) study found that students with high creative abilities have a higher level of reading and enjoying books compared to students with low creative abilities (see Yurdakal, 2019). Wang (2012) in his study concluded that creativity scores, especially elaboration scores, are significantly correlated with reading/writing attitudes. Other studies that are also related to this issue are studied by Wright (2012) and Susanti (2022).

On the other hand, related to assessment guidelines or rubrics, from a number of studies it is found that teachers' understanding of assessment rubrics tends to be low. From the results of a study by Setiadi (2016) regarding the implementation of assessment, it was found that among the problems faced by teachers was the preparation of assessment guidelines or rubrics. The results of other studies related to teachers' lack of understanding of assessment including rubrics are the results of studies by Abidin (2012), Pratiwiningtyas et al. (2017), Nurkhan (2016), and Subagiyo and Safrudiannur (2013/2014). Therefore, studies related to creative reading teaching

materials complete with assessment rubrics are important to be carried out in the form of development research.

In relation to this, the problems of this study are (1) what are the needs of junior high school Indonesian language teachers related to HOTS-based creative reading teaching materials and assessment rubrics? (2) How are HOTS-based creative reading teaching materials and assessment rubrics developed? (3) Are the developed HOTS-based creative reading teaching materials and assessment rubrics suitable for teachers' needs, valid and reliable, and easy to use? Referring to the problem formulation, the objectives of this study are to (1) analyze the needs of teachers to develop HOTS-based creative reading teaching materials and assessment rubrics, (2) develop the instruments, and (3) assess the developed instruments.

METHODS

This study was conducted in the form of research and development of teaching programs as proposed by Borg & Gall (2007) and Cresswell (2014), which is a process used to develop and validate educational products. The steps include (1) conducting a study of the product to be developed, (2) developing the product based on the results of the study, (3) conducting field testing in accordance with the background where the product will be used, and (4) reviewing the decisions obtained from the field trial. The study was carried out in three phases, namely (1) the needs analysis phase, (2) the design and development phase, and (3) the implementation and assessment phase. Each phase is interdependent and constitutes a circle (Alamsyah, 2021). The three phases were carried out referring to the teaching design steps of the Kemp Model (Morisson et al., 2004).

The first phase of the study, the needs analysis phase, involved five seventh-grade Indonesian language teachers from both schools. Furthermore, the second phase, namely design and development. In this phase, three HOTS-based creative reading teaching material instruments and two assessment rubrics were developed and then assessed by the experts. Next, the third phase, namely the implementation phase and small group and large group assessments. The small group assessment was conducted at SMP Negeri 18, involving one Indonesian language teacher and eight students each from three parallel VII grade classes. The large group assessment was conducted at SMP Negeri 8, involving one Indonesian language teacher and grade VII students from three parallel classes. Data collection used interview techniques, document analysis, and observation. Data analysis was conducted qualitatively.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

The results of this study refer to the data from the first-phase, second-phase, and third-phase studies which are interrelated and interdependent. The results of the first phase study show that teachers need creative reading teaching materials complete with assessment rubrics because teachers are still faced with difficulties in scoring student work as part of language learning assessment.

A total of three creative reading teaching material instruments have been developed in the second phase, namely (1) Reconstructing the illogicality of the text, (2) Transforming dialogue text into narrative text, and (3) Reconstructing text based on random images. Meanwhile, in this phase, two assessment rubrics have been developed,

namely (1) holistic assessment rubric and (2) analytic assessment rubric. The teaching materials and assessment rubrics developed in the first phase were recognized as prototype 1 instruments. After going through expert and user assessments, revisions and refinements were made, and then it was recognized as a prototype-2 instrument. The results of the expert and user assessments showed that the three creative reading teaching material instruments and the two assessment rubrics developed met the requirements of validity, reliability, practicality of use, easy to understand, and accordance with teacher needs. The next step is the third phase activity, which is small group and large group implementation and assessment.

From the data obtained from the results of implementation and assessment in small groups and large groups, it can be stated that the three creative reading teaching material instruments and the two assessment rubrics developed: (1) can be used by teachers in accordance with the procedures arranged in the instrument, (2) students can understand well the instructions for doing the task as stated in the instrument, and (3) the scores achieved by students from each instrument are in the Moderate, Good, and Very Good categories. However, on the other hand, there were also a number of technical weaknesses that required revision and improvement.

Discussion

The design and development of teaching material instruments and assessment rubrics for this study are based on the data from the analysis of teacher needs obtained in the first phase of the study. The instrument that had been developed in the early stages of the second phase was recognized as the prototype 1 instrument and after going through expert and user assessments, the entire instrument was re-examined, revised, and refined and henceforth it was recognized as the prototype 2 instrument. Subsequently, the prototype 2 instrument was assessed in small groups and large groups and this was carried out in the third phase.

The data obtained from the results of expert and user assessments and the results of small group and large group assessments of creative reading teaching material instruments (1) Reconstructing text illogicality, (2) Converting dialogue text into narrative text, and (3) Reconstructing text based on random images are that the three teaching material instruments are (1) suitable for creative reading learning materials at the junior high school level, (2) conforms to the curriculum, (3) can be customized, (4) the procedure is easy to understand so that it is easy to apply, (5) the scores achieved by students as a result of the assessment of the three instruments reach the Moderate, Good, and Very Good grades, and (6) accommodates the HOTS demands of language learning based on the 2013 Curriculum and Merdeka Curriculum.

Technical problems are found in the Reconstructing text based on random image instruments. Important notes related to the assessment results of the instrument are (1) each picture must be clearly visible, (2) the time duration for learning using these teaching materials needs to be increased to 3 lesson hours, and (3) under certain conditions it can be used as a homework assignment.

Meanwhile, the holistic and analytic assessment rubric developed in this study, apart from being specifically developed for creative reading assessment, can also be used to guide learning assessment of other topics including those related to writing skills. This means that the assessment rubric developed in this study can be used by teachers for the assessment of other aspects of language skills. The assessment results prove that (1) the

two models of assessment rubrics are in accordance with the needs of teachers, (2) teachers rarely make assessment rubrics, and (3) teachers can apply the rubrics in the scoring process, especially those related to the three instruments of creative reading teaching materials in this study.

CONCLUSION

There are a number of things that need attention in developing learning instruments (products), namely (1) the views and needs of users, (2) the products developed need to go through a process of expert and user assessment and the results need to be re-examined, revised, and refined, (3) the product needs to be assessed in real conditions involving users and the results are refined to produce the final product. The three instruments of creative reading teaching materials and the two assessment rubrics developed in this study through three phases meet the requirements of validity, reliability, and according to teacher needs.

Recommendation

The final product of creative reading teaching materials developed in this study can be disseminated in a wider scope and is open to modification according to the interests of its use. Meanwhile, the holistic and analytical assessment rubrics developed for the purpose of assessing student worksheets resulting from comprehension tasks/tests of creative reading teaching materials are also open to being customized for the assessment of other aspects of language skills.

REFERENCES

- Abidin, Y. (2012). Model penilaian otentik dalam pembelajaran membaca pemahaman berorientasi pendidikan karakter [Authentic assessment model in learning reading comprehension oriented to character education]. *Jurnal Pendidikan Karakter*, 2. <https://journal.uny.ac.id/>
- Alamsyah, Teuku. (2021). *Pembangunan instrumen pentaksiran kemahiran membaca dalam pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia Sekolah Dasar* [The development of reading proficiency assessment instruments in Elementary School Indonesian language learning]. Unpublished Thesis, Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris, Perak, Malaysia.
- Anderson, Lorin W. & Krathwohl, David R. (Eds.). (2017). *Kerangka landasan pembelajaran, pengajaran, dan asesmen revisi taksonomi pendidikan Bloom* (Agung Prihantoro, Penerjemah) [Basic framework for learning, teaching and assessment, revised Bloom's taxonomy of education (Agung Prihantoro, Translator)]. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Banu, M. Z. Annes Fathima & Gandhi, S. Mercy Gna. (2017). A study on integrating technology in material development and task design. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science Invention (IJHSSI)*, 6(10), 46–49.
- Bialik, Maya et.al. (2015). *Character education for the 21st century: what should students learn?* Center for Curriculum Redesign Boston, Massachusetts. www.curriculumredesign.org
- Borg, W. R. & Gall, M. D. (2007). *Educational research: an introduction*. New York and London: Longman Inc.

- Bukoye, R. O. (2019). *Utilization of instruction materials as tools for effective academic performance of students: implications for counselling*. Proceedings 2019, 2, 1395; doi:10.3390/proceedings2211395
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research design: qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. California: Sage Publications.
- Dahar, M. A., & Faize, F. A. (2011). Effect of the availability and the use of instructional material on academic performance of students in Punjab (Pakistan). *Middle Eastern Finance and Economics*, 11. <http://www.eurojournals.com/>
- Harsono, Y. M. (2007). Developing learning materials for specific purposes. *TEFLIN Journal*, 18(2).
- Maxwell, M., Stobaugh, R., & Tassell, J. H. (2017). *Student engagement. In real-world learning for elementary schools: Digital tools and practical strategies for successful implementation*. Bloomington, IN: Solution Tree.
- Morrison, G. R., Ross, S. M., Kalman, H. K., & Kemp, J. E. (2004). *Designing effective instruction*. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, Inc.
- National Education Association (NEA). (2010). *Preparing 21st century students for a global society: an educator guide for the "four Cs"*: <http://www.nea.org/>
- Nurkhan. (2016). Peningkatan pengelolaan penilaian Kurikulum 2013 melalui pendampingan bagi guru sekolah dasar [Improved management of 2013 Curriculum assessments through assistance for elementary school teachers]. *Jurnal Refleksi Edukatika*, 7(1).
- Pratiwiningtyas, B. N., Susilaningih, E., & Sudana, I. M. (2017). Pengembangan instrumen penilaian kognitif untuk mengukur literasi membaca Bahasa Indonesia berbasis model PIRLS pada siswa Kelas IV SD [The development of a cognitive assessment instrument to measure Indonesian reading literacy based on the PIRLS model in Class IV elementary school students]. *Journal of Research and Educational Research Evaluation*, 8(8).
- Setiadi, Hari. (2016). Pelaksanaan penilaian pada Kurikulum 2013 [The implementation of assessments in the 2013 Curriculum]. *Jurnal Penelitian dan Evaluasi Pendidikan*, 20(2), 166-178.
- Subagiyo, L., & Safrudiannur. (2014) Implementasi Kurikulum 2013 pada jenjang SD, SMP, SMA, dan SMK di Kalimantan Timur Tahun 2013/2014 [The implementation of the 2013 Curriculum at elementary, middle school, high school and vocational school levels in East Kalimantan 2013/2014]. *Pancaran*, 3(4), pp. 131-144. <https://jurnal.unej.ac.id/index.php/>
- Supardi. (2020). *Landasan pengembangan bahan ajar menuju kemandirian pendidik mendesain bahan ajar berbasis kontekstual* [The foundation for developing teaching materials towards teacher independence in designing contextual-based teaching materials]. Mataram: Sanabil.
- Susanti, E. (2022). Korelasi antara kemampuan literasi membaca pemahaman terhadap kemampuan berpikir kreatif Matematika siswa Kelas V SD [The correlation between literacy skills, reading comprehension and creative thinking abilities in mathematics for fifth grade elementary school students]. *Journal of Elementary Education*, 5(3).
- Tomlinson, B. (2012). Materials development for language learning and teaching. *Language Teaching*, 45(2), 143-179.

- Tomlinson, Brian (Ed.) (2011). *Materials development in language teaching second edition*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Umam, C. (2015). Developing instructional materials of English Morphology for English Department college learners. *Journal on English as a Foreign Language*, 5(1).
- Wang, A. Y. (2012). Exploring the relationship of creative thinking to reading and writing. *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, 7(1), 38-47.
- Wright, S. (2012). Flip this: Bloom's taxonomy should start with creating. Mind Shift. <http://ww2.kqed.org/mindshift>
- Yurdakal, I. H. (2019). Examination of correlation between attitude towards reading and perception of creative reading. *European Journal of Educational Research*, 8(2), 443-452.
- Yurdakal, I. H. (2018). The effects of creative reading practices on the primary school 4th graders' improving reading and the skills of creative thinking. (Unpublished doctorate dissertation). Pamukkale University, Denizli, Turkey.