



Original Article

Implementation of the Value of Pluralism in Film “Tanda Tanya (?)”

Asri Yulianti^{1✉}, Wawan Darmawan²

^{1,2}Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia

Correspondence Author: yuliantiasri13@upi.edu[✉]

Abstract:

In modern times, technology is increasingly sophisticated, one of which is the development of film at this time which has developed more rapidly. Various kinds of films as a means of entertainment on television screens, computers, laptops, and others that always convey messages in films. This study aims to describe the message contained in the film “Tanda Tanya (?)”, this film aired in 2011 directed by Hanung Bramantyo. When this film was released, there were pros and cons because this film was quite sensitive. The film Tanda Tanya (?) has told the story of various tribes, religions, races, cultures, with conflicts such as berating one religion and even each other's race. The method used is a descriptive qualitative approach. The results showed that the film by Hanung Bramantyo functionally has multiculturalism, pluralism, and religious values. Then there is a human relationship with God, their respective beliefs, example, and the value of jihad as the closing of the film.

Keywords: film, tanda tanya (?), pluralism.

Introduction

Indonesia is an archipelagic country that has a variety of cultures, races, religious tribes, beliefs, regional languages, and does not forget to be rich in abundant natural resources, that is why Indonesia is different from other countries. With a variety of various countries, this country is often nicknamed the Emerald country of the Equator because Indonesia has very, very abundant wealth such as emeralds. Indonesia is part of Southeast Asia, the Indonesian nation consists of approximately 700 tribes spread from Sabang to Merauke. Indonesia has a diversity that includes RACE, Religion, Tribe, group customs and culture. This has been recognized by the founding fathers of the nation and formulated in the frame of unity with the meaning of "Bhineka Tunggal Ika". However, differences can be a source of problems if not anticipated early. This difference can lead to new problems in society such as corruption, collusion, nepotism,



<https://jurnal.usk.ac.id/riwayat>

Received: Januari 21, 2024 – Revised: April 22, 2024- Accepted: June 12, 2024 - Published online: July 1, 2024

thuggery, political feuds, poverty, violence, separatism, environmental destruction and loss of humanity to respect each other. These problems occur because of the intersection between groups, races, tribes and religions that consider that their group is the most correct.

Examples of conflicts and violence related to SARA are the Poso conflict in 1998, the Ambon conflict in 1999, the Dayak-Madura conflict in Kalimantan in 1998, the vertical conflict of the Free Aceh Movement (GAM) in 1976-1982, conflicts between religious groups in Central Sulawesi and Maluku in 1998-2001, these 5 SARA conflicts have occurred in Indonesia ([Diputa & rizka, 2016](#)). Various kinds of problems related to SARA that increased rapidly throughout 2012 to 2013 and even until 2019, can last be seen during the political contestation of the DKI Jakarta gubernatorial and deputy governor elections which then raised many SARA issues everywhere. Of course this is very concerning and quite sad because Indonesia is very rich in differences. The Youth Pledge and Bhinneka Tunggal Ika were injured by unscrupulous parties who did not have awareness of the importance of national unity. In the book "The Issue of Pluralism in Media Perspective" ([Sumarno et al, 2009](#)), said that plurality of societies can be a source of constructive power or destructive danger. Religious diversity. The mentioned conflicts arise because of chauvinistic attitudes, excessive pride in one's own religion, and the belief that one's own religion is most correct, causing horizontal conflicts that are counterproductive in the plurality of societies.

Pluralism comes from the Latin "plus, pluris" meaning "more" ([Mifta Ulya, 2013, p:107](#)). In English, pluralism comes from the adjective "plural" which means "more than one" ([English Dictionary, 2000, p:971](#)). Pluralism is an attitude that emphasizes the fact of a plurality of people living together in a society. Pluralism which gives direction that no religion is the same, but pluralism is more directed towards an attitude of openness between others. The preferred attitude is mutual respect, respect, help, guard, and non-interference between people on a global scale ([Mifta Ulya, 2013, p: 170](#)). Religious pluralism includes the recognition of a common foundation for religious pursuits and the convergence of world religions. For others, pluralism involves mutual respect for different worldviews and full recognition of those differences. Both varieties support tolerance by emphasizing individual religious freedom and recognition of denominations as distinctive answers ([M. Atho Mudzhar, 2005](#)). The goal of pluralism is to create good communication between majority and minority groups to overcome ignorance and cultural misunderstandings. The pluralistic view of Abdurrahman Wahid or Gus Dur emphasizes differences in culture, nation, language, ethnicity, race, ethnicity, color, and religion. Gus Dur seeks to introduce the concept of pluralism to the world ([Eko Setiawan, 2017, p:57](#)). There fore we need to change the wrong thinking to establish harmony between religious communities in a country that is diverse in culture and religion. Problems between theology, history, and primordialism arise due to religious pluralism in Indonesia. Religious people are in an internal environment of pluralism, facing theological problems. The Dutch colony became a burden in history, because it supported Christianity. Primordialism is thought to hinder the development of religious thought. The factors causing the plurality of Indonesian society are: (1) geographical conditions that cover a large area from East to West and North to South. (2) Indonesians located between the Indonesian Ocean and the Pacific Ocean, which affects the religious plurality in society. Hindu and Buddhist influences from India, followed by Islam and Christianity, influenced Indonesia's pluralistic culture ([Icthiyanto, 2005, pp:47-48](#)). Indonesian Muslim scholars have different

understandings of religious pluralism. Religious pluralism in different senses is a social reality. Sociological recognition of religious pluralism does not permit the recognition of ethics and truth from other religions (Hanik, 2014). It is inevitable that the phenomenon of religious pluralism exists in Indonesia. Inter-religious conflict occurs if pluralism is not handled properly. Religious conflicts often occur and need the right approach to resolve the problem. Religion helps create good relationships (Sumbullah et al, 2013).

Film is one alternative to planting important information as part of mass communication media that many people enjoy. As a medium of mass communication, film has an important role in channeling messages to the audience. One of the films that discusses the SARA conflict is the *Tanda Tanya (?)* film by Director Hanung Bramantyo. Hanung Bramantyo is one of the directors who has created many quality films, including *Brownies* (2004), *School End Notes* (2005), *Red Lantern* (2006), *Ayat-Ayat Cinta 1* (2008), *Perempuan Berkalung Sorban* (2009), *Sang Pencerah* (2010), *Kick from the Sky* (2010), *Tanda Tanya (?)* (2011), *Paper Boat* (2012), *Cinta Tapi Beda* (2012), *Rudy Habibie* (2016). In addition, when the film was shown, *Tanda Tanya (?)* caused a lot of controversy because its content was considered religious pluralism. Besides causing controversy, the film also won one of the Citra Award nominations at the 2011 Indonesian Film Festival. Based on previous research conducted by Jaga Mitri Salhi Putra and Heri Supriyanto, University of Bengkulu in 2020 entitled "Pluralism in Merah Putih Film III" with the results of research showing that *Film Merah Putih III* discusses a sense of nationalism and plurality in character or characterization. Pluralism suggests engagement with diversity as equality without rank or comparison. The meaning of pluralism in *Merah Putih III* shows that differences in background can be united through the spirit of Indonesia with *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika*. Through this film, Indonesia should be able to achieve ideal pluralism. And the concept of *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika* is a trigger for enthusiasm in interpreting pluralism. Countries have different cultures and backgrounds, but are united by the same ideology, namely *Pancasila*. This ideology binds all Indonesians.

Tanda Tanya (?) film tells the story of religious diversity and tolerance in *Pasar Baru, Semarang*. Here, there are mosques, churches, and temples adjacent and their adherents have a relationship with each other. The film highlights three families with different backgrounds: *Tan Kat Sun's* family who own a Chinese cuisine restaurant, the humble *Soleh Family* with *Soleh* who does not yet have a job but has a beautiful wife and *solehah*, and *Rika's* family who are widowed with a child and decide to convert to Catholicism after divorce. This film shows how the relationship between these families is affected by differences in views of religious and ethnic status. Although there are conflicts, friendship is also established between them. This film gives a message about the importance of tolerance in religious and cultural diversity in Indonesia. With the value of pluralism in the film *Tanda Tanya (?)*, researchers conducted research on audience acceptance of pluralism in the film. The scenes and subtitles in the film *Tanda Tanya (?)* gain meaning upon acceptance by the audience, who interpret accordingly their cultural background and subjective experiences. The audience is considered a producer of meaning, not just a consumer of media content. Ideology is present in every media text, so it is important to study audience reception. Research was conducted on the audience's interpretation of pluralism in the film *Tanda Tanya (?)*. Therefore, this study aims to analyze the content of pluralism values in the film.

Methods

In this study, researchers used descriptive qualitative methods, namely the type of research that describes and explains factually what was found in the film, especially

in the implementation of messages in the film Tanda Tanya (?). This research is expected to find and describe data thoroughly related to this film. The source of the research data using data is the youtube movie Tanda Tanya (?). The data in this study is written information data in article documents that discuss problems related to pluralism values. The data collection technique used is to use documentation techniques because the source of data in this study is film, this technique is done by searching for main data in the form of film data and examining through the *youtube* application. And data analysis techniques data researchers use analysis techniques. Work analysis technique is a research method by conducting research from one's work ([Keraf in Suroto, 1990, p: 120](#)). Work analysis techniques are used to analyze the values contained in the film.

Results

All circles pay great attention to the phenomenon of religious life in Indonesia. Cases such as interfaith marriage and blasphemy are common. Religions recognized as life guidelines will be dynamic, universal, flexible, and forward-looking. The dynamics of religious life are reflected in its adherents ([Ghazali & Busro, 2017](#)). This Tanda Tanya (?) film is a film that really illustrates the obstacles regarding the lack of respect for other people's beliefs. In accordance with the element of tolerance according to ([Umar Hasyim, 1979, p: 202](#)) in the book entitled "Tolerance and Religious Freedom in Islam as a Basis for Interreligious Dialogue and Harmony". Tolerance can be defined by fulfilling several elements, such as granting freedom and independence, recognizing everyone's rights, respecting the beliefs of others, and understanding each other. Here are the roles and problems of each in the film:

- Revalina Sayuthi Temat as Menuk (Islam, Soleh's wife, chinese food restaurant employee, Ping Hen's ex-lover). Menuk is known as a wife who is obedient to her husband.
- Reza Rahadian as Soleh (Islam, Menuk's husband, unemployed and banser), Soleh has a pessimistic nature due to unemployment so that there is often a commotion in his household so Soleh throws inappropriate sentences to Menuk to find an established husband. But thanks to hard work in finding a job, Soleh finally became a banser of Nahdlatul Ulama (NU).
- Agus Kuncoro as Surya (Islam, an extra actor who eventually became a successful actor), Surya who was often considered an extra actor for many years often received ridicule from his scope of work, but Surya did not give up easily and in the end he got the role of Jesus there was a considerable dilemma for fear of violating the religious norms he embraced, namely Islam, but after consulting with Ustadz finally Surya took the role of Jesus. After that Surya took an important role in the film who became a successful actor.
- Endhita as Rika (Catholic, widow, Abi's mother, bookstore owner), Rika is Catholic and converted to Islam because her husband is Muslim, after several years of marriage Rika and her husband were blessed with a son named Abi, and soon her husband asked to be polygamous and Rika certainly rejected the polygamy which led to divorce and Rika returned to her former religion which was Catholic. But Abi seemed disappointed because her mother never went to the mosque again and Rika gave an understanding to Abi who at first Abi was angry disappointed for days with her mother, then Abi accepted the situation, apologized to her mother, returned cheerful and Abi recited back at the mosque with her friends.

- Abi (Islam, son of Rika), Abi is an elementary school student who diligently recites to the mosque but it turns out that Abi gets ridicule from her friends that her mother is no longer allowed to go to the mosque, and Abi goes home to complain to her mother. Abi who was still young did not understand, his emotions were still turbulent, disappointed angry with his mother for days and soon Abi apologized, accepted the situation, Abi said that "Abi is not angry in Islam can not be angry for more than 3 days" then Abi smiled at her mother, and Abi went to recite to the mosque again.
- Rio Dewanto as Hendra or Ping Hen (Confucian Chinese, son of Tan Kat Sun, Menuk's former lover), Ping Hen a young man who likes to get drunk, rarely worships unlike his father and mother who are devout in religion, temperamental since being left married by Menuk, does not have a spirit of tolerance like his father and mother, Ping Hen who does not give prayer time and Eid leave to his employees gives the impression of not respecting fellow humans, Not long ago, the restaurant was burned by residents because Ping Hen did not give tolerance, where Ping Hen acted quite hard, not gentle and had a high tolerance spirit like his father. After the fire, Ping Hen's father recurred and died after his father's personal departure Ping Hen changed for the better, and began to find his true identity and embraced Islam and continued the business of halal chinese food restaurants.
- Henky Solaiman as Tan Kat Sun (Confucian Chinese, father of Ping Hen, owner of Chinese food restaurant), a Chinese food restaurant entrepreneur who provides food that contains non-halal and halal. Tan Kat Sun, who has a very high spirit of tolerance, is obedient to worship.
- Edmay as Lim Giok Lie (Confucian Chinese, wife of Tan Kat Sun, mother of Ping Hen, owner of Chinese food restaurant), A wife of a Chinese food restaurant entrepreneur, Ci Lim who always follows the rules of her husband, obeys worship, and mediates when Tan Kat Sun her husband and her son Ping Hen disagree.

In the film, there are several screen shot scene images that correspond to pluralism



Source: Youtube

Figure 1. Menuk and Ci Lim worshipping.

The initial scene is at the house of Tan Kat Sun, a restaurant owner who has a high tolerance spirit by giving prayer time to his Muslim employees. Then there is Ci Lim who is carrying out worship, their activities are doing worship according to their respective beliefs in front of the prayer table and the hallway not far from the prayer table. In worship, Ci Lim stood holding hiosua. While Menuk prays on his prayer mat. Tan Kat Sun's wife wears brick-red clothes without collars, short sleeves and floral patterns. While Menuk wears white mukena. Mukena is the clothing that Muslims wear when praying, especially women. The togetherness they do shows the nuances of

harmony between religious communities. Differences in beliefs are not a barrier to worship together. Mamih worships side by side with Menuk who is a Muslim and does not mind performing worship together. In fact, this is a form of harmony shown by both.



Source: Youtube

Figure 2. Dialogue between commander and Soleh.

The conversation gave understanding to Soleh, the commander trying to change the negative view of Islam as a terrorist religion. This view arose because of a series of church bombing events. To prove that Islam is not terrorist, commanders rejected such views by guarding churches and considering them a form of jihad. Jihad is defined as a desperate struggle. Christmas services are threatened by acts of terrorism that want to bomb churches while worshippers are worshipping inside.



Source: Youtube

Figure 3. Father and his congregation.

The congregation's debate caused a commotion and Father in the church stopped the debate and gave an understanding between the congregation pro and con regarding the figure of Jesus played by Muslims. Romo argued that Surya, despite being a Muslim, deserves a role as an actor in the Christmas Eve drama without destroying faith. Father stressed the importance of tolerance and recognition of the rights of every individual, saying that the destruction of faith is caused by ignorance, not by differences in beliefs. Father said, "Why make a fuss about small things and sacrifice big things". Because at the time of the debate the contra congregation said to cancel the event at the church because of the portrayal of Jesus from Islam.



Source: Youtube

Figure 4. Surya plays Jesus.

Before Surya played Jesus Surya had a dilemma and Surya consulted an Ustadz:

Ustadz

"There's nothing wrong with you trying, Sur."

Sun

"Means to enter the church?"

Ustadz

"It's just your physique, just your body. Even if you are in a land that tyranny though, but if you believe you can guard your heart, your faith only for Allah Almighty."

Surya's character is not diligent in worship, but has changed after receiving an offer to play the character of Jesus. Changes can be seen in the discipline of worship, especially in carrying out prayers. Surya's character shows that openness to different shared experiences allows religions to understand each other objectively. This results in an attitude of respect for diversity, which is an important aspect of pluralism.



Source: Youtube

Figure 5. Soleh took away the bomb to save the churchgoers.

At the end of *this scene* there is a jihad value played by Soleh being a banser who is guarding a big event in the church, when Soleh watches into the church Soleh suspects a large enough box under the congregation chair after being seen by Soleh how surprised that the box contains a bomb, not long Soleh takes the box away and shouts that "There is a bomb watch out" after carrying the bomb out of the church shortly after the bomb It exploded and the churchgoers came out in panic to hear the sound of crying and screaming on that dark Christmas Eve. *The scene* is taken from the true story of Alm Riyanto Banser Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) who hugged the bomb until it exploded and his body bounced up to 30 meters and shortly followed by the second bomb explosion, the event located at the Indonesian Pentecostal Church or GSJPDJ Eben Haezer Mojokerto East Java (Christmas Eve in 2000).

From the roles, problems and *scenes* in the film, there are Tan Kat Sun, Mamih, Menuk, Surya, and Rika who show appreciation for different people, both ethnicities and beliefs. This award can be seen through the narrative code at the beginning of the story, for example Chinese restaurant owners who hire Muslim employees, give prayer times to employees, when the fasting month closes the curtains of restaurants, separates halal and non-halal cooking utensils, and gives holidays during Eid. The film features a protagonist who is willing to build relationships with others, including those of different faiths. An example is the cooperation between Muslim employees and Confucian Chinese which shows harmony. The role of this employee is strengthened by being the wife of the religious Banser NU. In addition, the film also highlights the appreciation of one's decision to convert, as done by Rika's character who converted from Islam to Catholicism. According to (Rousseau, 2008) said that everyone should not restrict the rights of others, including in choosing religion.

The right to choose a religion according to an individual's beliefs should be protected as a universal right to religious freedom. Conversion is not a threat, but rather an individual right that must be respected. The consequences of choosing religion must be accounted to God, not man. The film supports conversion as an individual right and shows that friendships can be maintained regardless of status. This film is considered as hope in religious conflicts by presenting a figure who is pro pluralism. The recognition of Confucianism in the film shows the importance of inter-religious involvement. Tolerance of different beliefs and acceptance of diversity are considered accepted facts. Respect for differences in beliefs among religious people is considered important.

Conclusion

The Pluralism is an understanding that values diversity in culture, language, ethnicity, race, ethnicity, and religion. Pluralism does not generalize religious teachings, but recognizes different values of truth. Human values and peace are upheld in pluralism, with love as the main teaching in every religion. In Indonesia, pluralism gives individuals the right to choose their religion according to their individual beliefs. This has been mentioned in the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia Article 28 E paragraph 1 which states that "Everyone is free to practice religion and worship according to his religion, choose education, and teaching, choose employment, choose citizenship, choose residence in the territory of the country or leave it, and has the right to return".

The challenge of Indonesia as a country of religious pluralism is the large number of religions and beliefs held by Indonesian society, which can cause small to large frictions. If this condition is not overcome, it can have an impact on the disintegration of the nation. For this reason, the need for an understanding of religious pluralism without conflict between religious communities is important to maintain healthy relationships. Indonesia as a plural country can be an example in maintaining inter-religious harmony. Tanda Tanya (?) films that contain pluralism values and problems of each actor or informant who have different religious, ethnic, backgrounds. The researcher concluded that the informants of the film were a way to build understanding of Interfaith and Pluralism to the community. All informants also agreed that interfaith should foster tolerance. If religious tolerance can be built properly, then the unity and unity of the Indonesian nation can be maintained. Conflicts between religious communities can threaten the integrity of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia (NKRI). Inter-religious tolerance must be maintained properly. The film Tanda Tanya (?) successfully conveys the values of tolerance and pluralism.

Theoretically, this research can contribute to similar research on other occasions in conducting research and can expand the discussion for future studies on the meaning of plurality, especially religion. Socially, this study tries to give a positive meaning to the community environment with the existence of religious plurality. This research is also expected to build people's mindsets in viewing differences from religious diversity. This research still has shortcomings, where the limitations of researchers who only focus on the problem of the meaning of the value of religious

plurality in the film Tanda Tanya (?) are expected to be studied more deeply in the future and not stop at this research.

Suggestion

In this research, it is hoped that the younger generation of readers from this research will add harmonization to the meaning and messages contained in the film Tanda Tanya (?) so that they are able to appreciate every difference between people, prioritizing unity and brotherhood among human beings. And inspire you to be more creative in making works that contain pluralism and multiculturalism because in Indonesia there are still often differences that cause problems from small to large by producing works through mass communication (film) that are in line with current developments.

References

- Azzuhri, M. (2012). The concept of multiculturalism and pluralism in religious education. *Tarbiyah Forum*. Vol 10. No. 1 June 2012.
- Huda, T, M., & Maghfiroh, A, I. (2019). Pluralism in the view of interfaith youth in Indonesia. *Satya Widya Journal of Religious Studies*. Vol 2 No. 1 June 2019.
- Lestari, J. (2020). Religious pluralism in Indonesia challenges and opportunities for the nation's needs. *Al-Adyan Journal Of Religious Studies*. Vol 1 No. 1 June 2020.
- Putra, S, M, J., & Supriyanto, H. (2020). Pluralism in the film Merah Putih III. *Kaganga Journal*. Vol 4 No. 2 October 2020.
- Son, S, M. (2020). Implementation of the concept of pluralism in building harmony in religious life in schools. *Journal of Social Sciences and Educational Sciences*. Vol 4 No. 3 July 2020.
- Sabiruddin., Purwanti, S., & Afriandy, H. (2018). The meaning of tolerance in the film Question Mark (?). *Ejournal of Communication Sciences*. Vol 6 (1) 2018.
- Setiawan, A, V. (2013). Representation of pluralism in the film "?" (Question mark). *Journal of E-Communication*. Vol 1 No. 1 Year 2013.
- Susanto, W, C., Hadi, P, I., & Aritonang, I, A. (2019). The audience's acceptance of pluralism in the film "Check the Shop Next Door". *Journal of E-Communication*. Vol 7 No. 1 Year 2019.